

BELIZE MUNICIPAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

Abbreviated Action Plan for the Dangriga Municipal Market Subproject

Introduction:

The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) of Belize Social Investment Fund (BSIF) conducted an evaluation exercise to evaluate whether the temporary and permanent relocation of some stall owners during and after the completion of civil works on the Dangriga Municipal Market would have any negative financial consequences on their livelihoods. The main output of the evaluation exercise(the first of two such evaluation exercises), was a report dated 15th, April 2011 which was shared with the Team Leader of the visiting World Bank Project Team (Ms. Yoonhee Kim) and the WB Social Specialist for the BMDP (Ms. Kimberly Vilar) during the project preparation stage of the subproject.

The general conclusions of the first evaluation report were: (a) the majority of the stall owners who will be relocated either temporarily or permanently during and after the completion of civil works on the market would not be experiencing any major loss of income sources or means of livelihood; and (b) those stall owners presently located in the parking-lot requested an increase in the proposed size of the new stalls that will be installed in the renovated and expanded market , while those stall owners located under the market awnings requested the construction of shutters for the security of their products, and the assurance from the PIU and Dangriga Town Council that they will not lose their original stall locations after the completion of civil works on the market.

Due to the premature termination of the works contract with the first contractor in September 2013 followed by a seven (7) month delay in the civil works which did not resume until April 2014, a second evaluation exercise was conducted with those vendors that were temporarily relocated to determine whether they were experiencing loss of income due to the delay. Initially, a total of twenty (20) vendors were temporarily relocated but this number was reduced to twelve (12) by July 2014 with the majority of them relocating to other locations of the municipality where they are more visible to the buying public. The results of the second evaluation are that on an average, the vendors were experiencing income losses of 25%.

Based on the results of the evaluation and in accordance with Involuntary Resettlement Policy Framework (IRF), the PIU prepared an Action Plan. The Plan reflects both the temporary relocation and income restoration measures pursued with those vendors that

were temporarily relocated during the implementation phase of civil works on the market subproject.

Description of Specific Activities under the Subproject

Due to the high demand for additional stall space at the Dangriga Municipal Market, coupled with the urgent need to re-acquire the parking-lot of the market which is being used for the erection of “make-shift stalls” by a large number of vendors, the Dangriga Town Council decided to seek funding from the WB to expand the present facility in an effort to meet these demands for stall space. In addition, the Town Council saw the need to rehabilitate and upgrade the plastic awnings which is used to protect those stalls owners located immediately outside the main walls of the market facility from the rain and sun, as well as to give the entire facility a facelift and make it more attractive and user-friendly to the buying public.

The project proposes to rehabilitate an existing building approximately 4,600square feet in area; to improve the working conditions of the Dangriga Town market vendors, and provide an extension of approximately 3,300 square feet for additional stall space for some of the vendors presently occupying the market’s parking-lot. On completion of the project, the facility will have the capacity to accommodate a total of twenty-two (22) stall-owners from those vendors occupying the parking-lot of the market

Specifically, the scope of works that will be executed will include the following elements:

- Preliminaries
- Demolition works & repairs to existing market
- New market block

New Works to exiting market building

- Replacing of roof structure including electrical works
- Replacing of fish stall structure
- Stainless steel counters in fish section

External Works

- New toilet block
- Sewage treatment system
- Garbage holding structure
- Sheet piling and river wall works
- Concrete swale, pavers, underground drains and earth drains
- Exterior plumbing including manholes, grease traps, waste water treatment system and all associated works

- New electrical service entrance including service entrance wall, underground power supply, the toilet block, new market block, and to the existing market building

Estimated Cost and Time Frame of the Project

A breakdown of the estimated cost of the project is outlined in the table below.

World Bank Loan	Government of Belize Counterpart Funding	Dangriga Town Council Counterpart Funding	Total
\$1,475,111.00	0	\$44,253.33 (3%)	\$1,519,364.33

The total estimated length of the construction phase of the project initially was estimated to be between eight (8) to ten (10) months. However, due to the termination of the first contractor in September 2013 and a halt in works, coupled with the re-starting of civil works in April 2014, the project completion date was adjusted to September 2014 (a total of 26 months since its commencement).

Census/Survey of Persons Affected by Relocation of Stalls

The main findings of a census conducted on all stall owners (inclusive of those in the parking lot and those located between the market proper and the Cubanos area) are presented in bullet format below. The details can be examined at annex #1.

- Age-range of vendors: 72% of the vendors are within the 20's to 40's age range
- Sex: 56% are females, while 44% are males
- Ethnicity: the majority of the vendors-70%, are of Mestizo ancestry
- Ethnic composition of the municipality: approximately 75% of the population are of Garifuna ancestry with smaller percentages of other groups e.g. Creoles, Mestizo etc.
- Type of products on sale: 43% sells clothing, footwear and household kitchen products; 32% sells fruits and vegetables; 13% sells cooked food; 8% sells meats, and 4% sells fish and other marine products
- Fees for rental of stalls: the majority of the vendors(70%), pays a weekly fee of between \$15 to \$22 per week while a small minority (about 10%) pays a weekly fee of just over \$30 per week for the use of their stalls
- Average weekly earnings of vendors. The level of earnings is dependent on stall location as outlined below:
 - (i) Stalls located in the parking-lot: between \$300 to \$1,000 per week

- (ii) Stalls located under the awnings: between \$900 to \$3,000 per week
- (iii) Stalls located inside the market selling cooked food: between \$600 to \$1,800 per week
- (iv) Stalls inside the market selling meats: \$1,000+ per week
- (v) Stalls inside the market selling fish and other marine products: \$900+ per week
- (vi) Stalls located outside the market adjacent to the Cubanos Area: between \$400 to \$600 per week

Description of the Compensation and other Resettlement Assistance

Below is a description of the different types of assistance that were made available to the stall owners as a consequence of their relocation (either temporarily or permanently):

(i) Temporary Relocation Program:

The main objective of this type of assistance was to address safety and income restoration issues among those vendors that were relocated temporarily during the project implementation phase of the subproject.

Due to the close proximity of heavy equipment being operated adjacent to market vendors and the buying public, coupled with associated insurance implications, a joint decision was reached between the main stakeholders that the main market building should be vacated during project implementation to minimize potential harm to end-users. The vendors that were relocated temporarily include those stall owners located inside the market and under the market awnings; those in the fish section; and those located between the main market and the Cubanos.

Based on the findings of an exercise executed jointly between the PIU and the DTC to determine the level of income loss among the relocated vendors due to undue delays in project implementation, it was agreed that the latter were experiencing income loss and were eligible for income restoration assistance from the DTC. Specifically, the following assistance was provided by the Dangriga Town Council for these vendors:

- Those vendors whose business is the provision of cooked food and meat products were housed inside the renovated slaughterhouse for health and hygienic reasons. All stalls within the slaughterhouse were provided with reliable supplies of running water and electricity with the expenses being met by the Town Council.
- All the other vendors including the fish, fruits and vegetable vendors were provided with temporary stalls that were erected immediately adjacent to the slaughterhouse building. While some degree of protection from the elements were

provided for these stalls, the owners were responsible for the security of their products during closing hours.

- A temporary location was identified for those vendors located between the market and the Cubanos area until a permanent location can be determined under phase 2 of the subproject.
- The DTC agreed to meet the utility expenses (water and electricity) amounting to a sum of BZ\$14,990.68 along with arrears for stall-fees amounting to BZ\$24,530.00 for all the temporarily relocated vendors for the entire period of project implementation: July 2012 to September 2014 (or whatever date the project is completed).
- The Project Steering Committee (PSC) at its August 2014 meeting approved financial reimbursements to four (4) of the temporarily relocated vendors for stall-fees paid to the DTC for the period: July 2012 to April 2014 amounting to BZ\$6,955.00.

(ii) Permanent Relocation Program:

The main objective of this type of assistance is to address concerns raised by those stall owners located in the parking-lot and who will be moved into the new market extension when the subproject is completed. The main needs that will be addressed under this type of assistance include:

- (a) The construction of an adequate number of stalls to accommodate each of the families that are presently in the parking-lot to a maximum of twenty-two (22) stalls.
- (b) The dimensions of the newly constructed stalls will not be less than 10'x12' to accommodate most if not all the products of the present stall owners.
- (c) The construction of security shutters for the security and safe-keeping of the products of those stall owners located under the awnings
- (d) In addition, temporary stalls will be erected in the area adjacent to the Cubanos to accommodate those vendors in the parking-lot who will be compensated with one or more stalls lost as a result of the Town Council's "one stall per family policy". A review of table# 1 below indicates that a total of five families (5) families will be affected by this policy including the Zepeda, Carillo, Segura, Arzu and Sho families.
- (e) The assurance from the local authorities (i.e. the Dangriga Town Council), that stall owners under the awnings will be returned to their original stall locations at the conclusion of works.

The final drawings and designs have been completed by the engineering consultant firm of Anthony Thurton & Associates. A total of twenty-two (22) new stalls complete with metal shutters will be accommodated in the new market extension, while all the stalls under the awnings will also be provided with metal shutters based on the requests of the vendors during project preparation stage.

(iii) Benefits-Sharing Program:

The main objective of this program is to ensure that the wider Dangriga community derives some benefits from the subproject particularly through the availability of job opportunities for its residents. It should be noted that both the poverty and unemployment levels for Dangriga are relatively high:32% and 40% respectively(2009), and hence the importance of creating job opportunities particularly for its relatively large under 30 age-group which accounts for more than 60% of its population.

While it is the expectation that the subproject will create job opportunities for local residents, it is important to note that the subproject contractor is not legally bound to do so, and can recruit his workforce from wherever he chooses. It is therefore critical that both the Dangriga Town Council and the PIU utilizes their influence and moral persuasion to ensure the availability of job opportunities for residents of the municipality. During the tenure of the first contractor (Mr. Smart) which ran from June 2012 and ended in September 2013, the number of job openings on the project held by residents from Dangriga was very limited with the majority of workers (75%+) originating from outside the Stann Creek District. However with the change in contractor in April 2014, there has been a significant increase in the number of residents from Dangriga being able to access jobs on the market subproject. For example in July 2014, out of a total work-force of seventeen (17), approximately twelve (12) were residents of Dangriga.

(iv) Special Needs Program:

The main objective of this program is to provide assistance to those stall owners who may have “special needs” including the elderly, and those with various types of disabilities. Those stall owners who might have disabilities and requires assistance will be referred to the appropriate agencies in Dangriga or otherwise for support services to address their specific needs. The program will be coordinated jointly between the Dangriga Town Council and the PIU (spearheaded by the Social Officer).

Table #1 below summarizes the following key factors for individual market vendors re: length of relocation, weekly income, valuation of income loss, level of vulnerability, and type of assistance program there are entitled to receive.

Table1: Data Showing Length of Relocation, Weekly Income, Valuation of Loss, Level of Vulnerability, and Type of Resettlement Assistance to Stall Owners

Name/Location of Stall Owners	Length of Relocation NA-Not Applicable	***Current Income	Valuation of Loss	Level of Vulnerability	**Type of Assistance P-Perm T-Temp BS- Ben/Sharing SN-Special Need
<u>Parking Lot(20)</u> Clemencia Perez	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Humberto Perez	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Roxanna Zepeda*	NA		One(1) stall	Low	P
Luis Zepeda*	NA		One(1) stall	Low	P
Yolanda Segura*	NA		One(1) stall	Low	P
Abdula Carrillo *(2 stalls)	NA		One(1) stall	Low	P
Jugo Caal	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Iris Caal	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Ana Caal	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Maximo Perez	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Jose Mejia	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Rosa Castillo	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Sandra Serrano	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Hilda Escobar	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Santos Molina			No Loss	Low	P

Dolores Gregorio	NA		No Loss	Low	P
Ophelia Mejia	NA		No Loss	Low	P
<u>Olga Mejia</u>	NA		No Loss	Low	P
<u>Lizett Gomes</u>	NA		No Loss	Low	P
<u>Malik Zepeda</u>	NA		No Loss	Low	P
<u>Under the Awnings(6)</u>					
Mauricio Mejia	26 months		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Aramonio Sho*	26 months		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Eliot Antonio	"		"	"	T/P
Eddie Arzu(2 stalls)	"		"	"	T/P
Ramona Jimenez	"		"	"	T/P
Elias Vasquez	"		"	"	T/P
<u>Stalls located between market proper and the Cubanos(4)</u>					
Maria Catalan	26 months		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Nicefero Itza	"		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
<u>Inside the Market(10)</u>					
<u>Vendors of Cooked Food</u>					
Julia Itza	26 months		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Zalene Noralez	"		"	"	T/P
Genova Sho*	"		"	"	T/P

Ophelia Garcia	“		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Myrna Albeno(new stall owner)	“				T/P
<u>Meat Vendors</u> Robert Vanegas	“		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Arturo Rosado	“		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
<u>Fish Vendors</u> Dennis Myers	“		Moderate	Moderate	T/P
Alexander Leslie	“		“	Moderate	T/P
<p>*denotes stall owners who are couples ** none of the vendors will be receiving assistance under the Benefit/Sharing and Special Needs Programs. However, in terms of the benefits received by the residents of the municipality, there has been a significant increase in the numbers employed by the project with the recent change of contractor when compared to the first contractor. *** for confidential purposes, the income of the vendors have not been publicized</p>					

Description of Consultations with Project Affected Persons (PAPs)

A total fourteen (14) sets of consultations have been held over the period: April 2011 to July 2014 between representatives of the Dangriga Town Council, market vendors and the PIU. These sessions were held either at the offices of the Dangriga Town Council, nearby offices (e.g.: District Education Centre and the HelpAge Center), or at the Municipal Market where one-on-one sessions are held between the vendors and the PIU. A brief description of the objectives of the sessions are outlined below; the details can be examined at annex #2 attached.

First Consultation: 11th, April 2011

Objectives of Sessions:

- To inform the Dangriga Town Council representatives about World Bank's requirement for the execution of an evaluation exercise to determine whether vendors who will be relocated due to renovation and expansion works on the Dangriga Market will experience loss of income or livelihoods
- To inform those market vendors who will be relocated due to renovation and expansion works about the need to conduct an evaluation exercise, and seek their permission and support for the execution of a small census/survey.
- For the PIU's engineer to outline the scope of civil works being proposed for the market inclusive of the proposed number of new stalls that will be available at the completion of works.

Second Consultation: 28th, April 2011

Objectives of Session:

- To share World Bank's response to the Evaluation Report with representatives of the Dangriga Town Council, and representatives of the vendors.
- To seek the vendors' support in supplying additional data to prepare an Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan which addresses IRF issues in the project.
- To inform vendors of the PIU's intention to include them in all upcoming consultations particularly those involving the engineering consultant when he commences work within the coming weeks to develop the designs, drawings etc for the project.

Third Consultation: 26th, May 2011

Objective of the Session:

- To seek vendors permission to collect additional data needed for the Abbreviated Action Plan based on World Bank's feedback on the first draft of the Plan

Fourth Consultation: 3rd, June 2011

Objective of the session:

- To enable the Social Officer to conduct a census on those stall owners who were not included in the random sample used in the initial census exercise that was conducted on the 11th, April 2011.

Participants:

Fifth Consultation: 8th, August 2011

Objective of the session:

To collect census information on those stall owners who are located between the market (proper) and the Cubanos area.

Sixth Consultation: 7th, November 2011

Objectives of the session:

- To inform the fish vendors that they will need to be relocated temporarily to the old slaughter house which is to the rear of the main market, during the execution of works on the fish section of the market.
- Secondly, those vendors located under the awnings were informed that repairs to the roofing and awnings will now be included in the scope of works under phase 1 of the subproject (and not phase 2 as originally agreed).

Seventh Consultation: 7th, December 2011

Objectives of the session:

- To discuss the temporary relocation to the new market extension of those vendors inside the market and those under the awnings during the execution of segment 2 of the subproject
- To share four(4) Agreement documents with the Dangriga Town Council and market vendors related to their relocation(either temporarily or permanently) during the execution phase of the subproject
- To collect the signatures of the market vendors for the Agreement documents as documentary evidence of their support to the proposed relocations

Eight Consultation: 6th, June 2012

Objectives:

- To inform the market vendors who have stalls inside and under the awnings of the main market building about a decision reached for the total evacuation of the market prior to the commencement of civil works
- To inform the vendors of plans for the temporary construction of market stalls and the provision of basic utility services to accommodate their temporary relocation
- To seek feedback from the vendors on the proposed adjustments to the relocation plan

Ninth Consultation: 31st, January 2013

Objective:

- To explain and reiterate the distribution system that will be utilized for the distribution of stalls in the new market extension once it is completed

Tenth Consultation: July 3rd, 2013

Objective:

- To conduct survey with market vendors who have been relocated temporarily to determine whether they have been experiencing a loss of income so far and if necessary, to recommend an income replacement proposal to the Dangriga Town Council

Note: Civil works on the subproject was temporarily halted in September 2013 due to the unsatisfactory performance of the contractor, and did not re-start until April 2014 with a new contractor.

Eleventh Consultation: 14th, January 2014

Objective:

To conduct discussions between the DTC and the PIU in relation to the drafting of a second proposal for income restoration for the relocated market vendors.

Twelfth Consultation: 11th, February 2014

Objective:

The presentation and discussion of the second income restoration proposal between the DTC and the PIU.

Thirteenth Consultation: 13th, May 2014

Objective:

To hold discussions between the DTC and PIU in light of the non-response from the DTC in relation to the second proposal for income restoration, and to chart the way forward

Fourteenth Consultation: 25th, June 2014

Objective:

To share the contents of the latest proposal (a compensation package) with the relocated vendors, and to solicit their signatures for inclusion to an Agreement document signifying their acceptance of the proposal.

It should be noted that all consultations that have been held with the stall owners were conducted in a culturally appropriate manner in that due consideration of vendors' working hours, and accessibility of meeting place were taken into consideration. For example, the meetings took place at either the town hall (which is adjacent to the market and within walking distance), at the nearby HelpAge Center, or at their individual stalls. The days selected for consultations are usually a Wednesday or Thursday which are two of the "slow days" for most stall owners (the busiest being Fridays and Saturdays). In addition, although the majority of the stall owners indicated that

they understood the English language, one of them (a Belizean born Mestizo), assists the PIU with translating from English to Spanish particularly for those stall owners whose first language is Spanish. Special translation services were not required for those stall owners with Garifuna or Maya ethnic ancestry since both groups are fluent in the English language.

It is important that the residents of Dangriga (whose population is about 75% Garifuna), are kept fully abreast of all developments related to the subproject, and as such the holding of regular public consultations by the Dangriga Town Council with both the vendors that will be experiencing relocation of their stalls (temporarily and permanently), as well as with the general population of the municipality is strongly recommended to ensure the “buying-in” of this project by all stakeholders. In light of the fact that a high proportion of the stall owners are of Mestizo ethnicity and are recent migrants from Guatemala, it is important that the communication messages with them are promoted in the Spanish and English languages for all the consultations. Both the local radio and TV stations should be utilized in the promotions.

Institutional Responsibility for Implementation and Procedure for Grievance Redress

The following institutions share the responsibility of planning and implementing the abbreviated resettlement plan for the Dangriga Municipal Market project.

Table 2: Institutional Arrangements and Sources of Funding

Institution/Group	Responsibilities	Time-Frame	Source of Funding	Costs
Project Implementation Unit (PIU) of BSIF	(a) Drafting of abbreviated resettlement action plan	Start Date: May 2012 Completion Date: Sept 2014	Earmarked project budget allocation	-costs related to traveling/subsistence/lodging for PIU staff members engaged in the Plan preparation and implementation process. - costs related to the payment of stall-fees reimbursements to four(4) market vendors by BSIF/PIU
	(b) Submit plan(first draft) to WB for review and approval	8 June 2011		
	(c) Disclosure of action plan with Dangriga Town Council, and reps. of the market vendors	On Going starting in May 2011 to Sept 2014		
	(d) Conduct on-going consultations with the	June 2011 to Sept 2014		

	Dang.TC and vendors during both the feasibility and construction phases of the project			
Dangriga Town Council	<p>(a) To support the PIU in accessing the relevant data needed for the drafting of the abbreviated action plan</p> <p>(b) Assist the PIU in mobilizing the main stakeholders for the holding of consultations, and provide a venue (if needed) for the sessions.</p> <p>(c) Meet specific demands from stall owners via assistance programs</p>	<p>May 2011– Sept 2014</p> <p>May 2011 to Sept 2014</p> <p>June 2011 to Sept 2014</p>	DTC and BSIF funds	-costs related to requests from stall owners under the four(4)types of program assistance
Project Affected Persons(market vendors)	<p>(a) Collaborate with the PIU in the execution of surveys/census and preparation of action plan</p> <p>(b) Participate in stakeholder consultations organized by the PIU/Dang TC during the feasibility and construction phases of the project.</p>	<p>April 2011- Sept 2014</p> <p>May 2011 to Sept 2014</p>	_____	-----
World Bank	(a) Provide guidance and training to	April 2011 to Sept 2014	WB Funds for BMDP	-costs related to providing training sessions in Social

	the PIU regarding the preparation and implementation of the Plan			Safeguards for PIU staff members
--	--	--	--	----------------------------------

Grievance Redress Mechanism:

A proactive approach has been adopted in relation to the grievance redress mechanism that will be utilized for the Abbreviated Action Plan for the Dangriga Market subproject should the need arises. Basically, it will be comprised of three tiers:

- (i) The Dangriga Town Council in consultation with a local mediation committee
- (ii) The Office of the Ombudsman
- (iii) The Legal Aid Office

It is anticipated that the number of cases which may need to be referred for redress will be relatively small, and that only the first tier of the redress mechanism (the local mediation committee) may need to be activated. A local mediation committee made up of community leaders will be established shortly with the support of the PIU’s Social Officer and the Dangriga Town Council.

Table 3: Grievance Redress Mechanism

Tiers of Grievance Redress Mechanism	Responsible Party	Mechanism	Time Frame to address grievance
First Tier	Dangriga Town Council in consultation with local mediation committee	Written grievance	1 week
Second Tier	Ombudsman	Case Submission	4 weeks(approx)
Third Tier	Legal Aid Office	Low Cost	Lengthy Process and long delays

Arrangements for Monitoring and implementation:

Based on the recommendations of the Social Assessment Consultancy that was executed during the project preparation stage of the BMDP, the PIU has agreed to implement one of the recommendations which dealt with the establishment of multi-sectorial monitoring committees at the municipal level for the BMDP. Each monitoring committee will be composed of nine (9) members, with not more than three (3) coming from the respective town/city councils and the remaining members drawn from civil society. One of the main justifications for the composition of these monitoring committees is to ensure (hopefully), some degree of continuity of its functions and work in the event of political changes at the municipal level following municipal elections which are due in March 2012.

The authority for the selection of members on the monitoring committees rests with the respective Town and City Councils (TCC's). The criteria for the selection of members include:

- A background in any of the following disciplines: civil engineering, traffic management, public health, education, and tourism.
- The individual has demonstrated in his/her interactions in the community, a willingness to serve their community either through a community-based group or individually
- At least two(2) members to be drawn from the Town/City Council
- At least seven(7)members to be drawn from the community

The PIU is fully aware that partisan politics is an integral aspect of the day to day reality of municipal level governance in Belize and as such, the PIU would like to promote the adoption of an “inclusive approach” by all TCC's in terms of prospective members' political background and affiliation. In other words, the PIU would like to see “ mixed memberships” in terms of members' political affiliation with representation from at least the two main political parties in the country (the governing party and the main opposition party).

Given that the vendors are not experiencing differentiated impacts based on ethnicity coupled with the Garifuna vendors' command of the English language; we have not proposed any differentiated representation of ethnicities on the monitoring committee. Moreover, consultations have been conducted in a culturally appropriate manner amongst the vendors by ensuring that Spanish-speaking vendors had access to an interpreter to voice their views.

The district level monitoring committees will be charged with the responsibility of monitoring the day to day project activities on the ground (inclusive of the abbreviated resettlement action plan for the Dangriga Municipal Market)and submit progress reports to the PIU.

Annex 1

Table1: Basic Demographic and Economic Data on Stall Owners

Type of Data	Stalls between market and Cubanos(4)	Stalls in Parking-Lot(17)	Stalls Under Awnings(6)	Stalls Inside Market(10)
Age	Age: 20's(1) 30's(1) 40's(1) 50's(1)	Age: 20's(4) 30's(6) 40's(4) 50's(2) 70's(1)	Age: 30's(2) 40's(3) 80's(1)	Age: 20's(2) 30's(4) 50's(2) 60's(2)
Sex	Male:2 Female:2	Male:7 Female:10	Male:3 Female:3	Male: 4 Female:6
Ethnicity	Mestizo(4)	Mestizo(16) Garifuna(1)	Mestizo(3) Maya(1) Garifuna(2)	Mestizo(3) Maya(1) Creole/Garifuna(1) Creole(3) Garifuna(1) East Indian(1)
Nationality	Naturalized Belizean originally from Guatemala(4)	Belizean Born:(2) Naturalized Belizean(originally from Guatemala): (13) Guatemalan(1) Honduran(1)	Belizean Born: (4) Naturalized Belizean(originally from Guatemala): (2)	Belizean Born: (7) Naturalized Belizean: (2) Guatemalan(1)
Products on Sale	Fruits/Vegetables(3) Clothing/Footwear(1)	Clothing(10) Clothing & Footwear(4) Household Appliances(1) Fruits/Vegetables(2)	Fruits & Vegetables(6)	Cooked Food(5) Fruits & Vegetables(1) Meats(2) Fish(2)
Stall-Fee/Payment basis	\$15.00 per 6 day week(3) \$20.00 per 6 day week(1)	\$22.00 per 6 day week(13) \$16.00 per 4 day wk(1) \$13.00 per 3 day wk(1) \$11.00 per 3 day wk(1) \$10.00 per 3 day wk(1)	\$15.00 per 6 day wk(6)	\$130.00 per month(5) \$110.00 per month(1) \$100.00 per month(1) \$10.00 per 2 day week(1) \$22.00 per 6 day week(2)
Agree/Disagree with proposed relocation	Agree(4)	Agree(15) Disagree(2)	Agree(6)	Agree(10)
Requests from	That they are	Increase size of new	Erect shutters and	No requests(7)

stall owners	provided with a space to sell their products at completion of the project(4)	stalls(4) Improved Security((2) No increase in stall-fee(2) No request(9)	return to original location(4) No request(2)	Erection of temp shelter(2) Improvement in behavior of fi
--------------	--	--	---	--

Annex 2:

Details of Consultations held between the PIU, DTC and the Vendors

First Consultation: 11th, April 2011

Objectives of Sessions:

- To inform the Dangriga Town Council representatives about World Bank's requirement for the execution of an evaluation exercise to determine whether vendors who will be relocated due to renovation and expansion works on the Dangriga Market will experience loss of income or livelihoods
- To inform those market vendors who will be relocated due to renovation and expansion works about the need to conduct an evaluation exercise, and seek their permission and support for the execution of a small census/survey.
- For the PIU's engineer to outline the scope of civil works being proposed for the market inclusive of the proposed number of new stalls that will be available at the completion of works.

Participants

- Mayor of Dangriga Town Council
- Town Administrator
- Supervisor of Works Department
- Market Keeper
- Social Officer(PIU)
- Engineer(PIU)
- Fourteen(14)representatives of market vendors (selected via random sampling)

Decisions /Action Taken:

- It was agreed that approximately twenty-two (22) new stalls will be available after the completion of the expansion works on the market. However, this number may change once the engineering consultant for the project completes his work in relation to the technical designs and drawings for the project.
- The Social Officer was given permission by the vendors to conduct a survey with them via the use of a questionnaire to solicit their views in relation to the proposed relocations of stalls and its potential impact on their livelihoods.

Second Consultation: 28th, April 2011

Objectives of Session:

- To share World Bank's response to the Evaluation Report with representatives of the Dangriga Town Council, and representatives of the vendors.
- To seek the vendors' support in supplying additional data to prepare an Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan which addresses IRF issues in the project.

- To inform vendors of the PIU's intention to include them in all upcoming consultations particularly those involving the engineering consultant when he commences work within the coming weeks to develop the designs, drawings etc for the project.

Participants:

- Mayor of Dangriga
- Town Administrator
- Market Keeper
- Social Officer(PIU)
- Four(4) representatives of market vendors

Decisions/Action taken:

- The Social Officer was able to collect additional data for inclusion in the drafting of the Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan which addresses IRF related issues in the project
- It was agreed that the distribution of new stalls inside the market will be based on a "one per family" basis (and not on the present system in which husbands/wives owns two or more stalls).

Third Consultation: 26th, May 2011

Objective of the Session:

- To seek vendors permission to collect additional data needed for the Abbreviated Action Plan based on World Bank's feedback on the first draft of the Plan

Participants:

- Social Officer
- Market Keeper(Asst)
- Fourteen(14)stall owners

Decisions/Action taken:

- The Social Officer (with the support of the market keeper), collected the additional data required for the Plan from the stall owners.

Fourth Consultation: 3rd, June 2011

Objective of the session:

- To enable the Social Officer to conduct a census on those stall owners who were not included in the random sample used in the initial census exercise that was conducted on the 11th, April 2011.

Participants:

- Social Officer
- Market Keeper(Asst.)
- Sixteen(16)stall owners

Decision/Action Taken:

- The Social Officer was able to conduct a second census whereby additional information was collected via a questionnaire from the remaining stall owners not covered in the first census.

Fifth Consultation: 8th, August 2011

Objective of the session:

To collect census information on those stall owners who are located between the market (proper) and the Cubanos area.

Participants:

- Market Keeper
- Four(4) stall owners

Decision/Action Taken:

- The Market Keeper was able to collect basic socio-demographic data on those stall owners whose stalls are located between the market and the Cubanos area and who were not included in the previous two censuses conducted by the PIU.

Sixth Consultation: 7th, November 2011

Objective of the session:

- To inform the fish vendors that they will need to be relocated temporarily to the old slaughter house which is to the rear of the main market, during the execution of works on the fish section of the market.
- Secondly, those vendors located under the awnings were informed that repairs to the roofing and awnings will now be included in the scope of works under phase 1 of the subproject (and not phase 2 as originally agreed).

Participants:

- Market Supervisor
- Asst Sup. Civil works
- Six(6) market vendors including one(1)fish vendor and five(5)vegetable/fruit vendors
- Social Officer(PIU)
- Engineer(PIU)
- Project Coordinator(PIU)

Decision/Action Taken:

Mayor Gongora indicated that the Council will be carrying out renovation works at the old slaughter-house to prepare it to receive the fish vendors who will be temporarily housed there during the execution of segment 1 of the works.

Seventh Consultation: 7th, December 2011

Objectives of the session:

- To discuss the temporary relocation to the new market extension of those vendors inside the market and those under the awnings during the execution of segment 2 of the subproject
- To share four(4) Agreement documents with the Dangriga Town Council and market vendors related to their relocation(either temporarily or permanently) during the execution phase of the subproject

- To collect the signatures of the market vendors for the Agreement documents as documentary evidence of their support to the proposed relocations

Participants:

- Mayor of Dangriga
- Town Administrator
- Project Coordinator
- Social Officer
- Forty-Five (45) market vendors including: (22) from the parking-lot; (17) from under the awnings, and (6) from the fish section.

Decision/Action Taken:

Mayor Gongora along with the town administrator were briefed on the contents of the four (4) Agreement documents, and after a similar briefing session with the market vendors (on a one-on-one basis), their signatures were procured for the Agreements.

Eight Consultation: 6th, June 2012

Objectives:

- To inform the market vendors who have stalls inside and under the awnings of the main market building about a decision reached for the total evacuation of the market prior to the commencement of civil works
- To inform the vendors of plans for the temporary construction of market stalls and the provision of basic utility services to accommodate their temporary relocation
- To seek feedback from the vendors on the proposed adjustments to the relocation plan

Participants:

- Town Administrator
- Human Resources Manager
- Councilors(2)
- Mayor's Secretary
- Market Vendors(approx. 40+)

Decisions/Action Taken:

The vendors expressed their satisfaction with the information that was presented to them re adjustments to the relocation plan, and indicated their appreciation that due to the complete evacuation of the main market during implementation, that the project will be completed at an earlier date compared to the initial plan.

Ninth Consultation: 31st, January 2013

Objective:

- To explain and reiterate the distribution system that will be utilized for the distribution of stalls in the new market extension once it is completed

Participants:

- Town Administrator
- Social Officer(PIU)

- Engineer(PIU)
- Project Coordinator(PIU)
- Market Supervisor(Dangriga TC)
- Market Vendors (located in the parking-lot area- ten(10)

Decisions/Action Taken:

The stall distribution system which was formulated and shared with the vendors at least one year ago was presented to the vendors in the Spanish language through a translator. Three (3) additional vendors from the parking-lot area whose names were not captured by the previous census exercises were added to the list of those vendors who will receive a stall in the new extension when it is complete. The Social Officer promised that he would return to Dangriga to meet those vendors from the parking-lot area who did not attend the meeting on a one-on-one basis. Finally, he promised to have key sections of the Plan translated into the Spanish language to facilitate the Spanish-speaking vendors.

Tenth Consultation: July 3rd, 2013

Objective:

- To conduct survey with market vendors who have been relocated temporarily to determine whether they have been experiencing a loss of income so far and if necessary, to recommend an income replacement proposal to the Dangriga Town Council

Participants:

- Market Supervisor
- Social Officer(PIU)
- Approximately seventeen(17) market vendors

Decisions/Action Taken:

The Social Officer with the support of the Market Supervisor conducted one-on-one interviews with those market vendors who have been relocated to the temporary stalls erected by the Town Council, to determine whether they have been experiencing loss of income since the relocation. A questionnaire which was prepared by the Social Officer was used to guide the interviews. The data collected was incorporated into a proposal accompanied by recommendations related to income restoration for the vendors and submitted to Mayor Swaso and his Council for their review and approval. A formal response from the DTC was received on the 2nd, September indicating that the recommendations for income restoration were rejected.

Note: Civil works on the subproject was temporarily halted in September 2013 due to the unsatisfactory performance of the contractor, and did not re-start until April 2014 with a new contractor.

Eleventh Consultation: 14th, January 2014

Objective:

To conduct discussions between the DTC and the PIU in relation to the drafting of a second proposal for income restoration for the relocated market vendors.

Present:

Mayor Swaso

Town Administrator

Market Supervisor

Public Relations Officer (PIU)

Local Government Officer (PIU)

Social Officer (PIU)

Decisions/Action Taken:

It was agreed that the focus of the second income restoration proposal was to be the waiving of future trade licenses by the DTC and the PIU was requested to come up with a draft proposal which was to be shared with the DTC within two week's time.

Twelfth Consultation: 11th, February 2014

Objective:

The presentation and discussion of the second income restoration proposal between the DTC and the PIU.

Present:

Mayor Swaso

Market Supervisor

Town Administrator

Town Accountant

Deputy Mayor

Social Officer (PIU)

Decisions/Action Taken:

A formal presentation of the second proposal was done by the SO which was followed by discussions. At the conclusion of the discussions, Mayor Swaso indicated that while he was in support of the proposal, he would like to share it with the other members of his Council before making a final decision concerning its acceptance. The PIU did not receive any formal response from the DTC in relation to the second proposal.

Thirteenth Consultation: 13th, May 2014

Objective:

To hold discussions between the DTC and PIU in light of the non-response from the DTC in relation to the second proposal for income restoration, and to chart the way forward

Present:

Mayor Swaso

Town Administrator

Finance Director

Project Coordinator (PIU)

Social Officer (PIU)

Local Government Officer (PIU)

Decisions/Action Taken:

The mayor presented a counter-proposal in the form of a compensation package for the relocated vendors in an effort to offset their losses. The main elements of the compensation package are:

1. To meet utility expenses(water and electricity) for the vendors for the period: July 2012 to the project completion date tentatively set for September 2014
2. To waive stall-fee arrears for all those vendors who are in arrears since the date of relocation (July 2012), and to waive the stall-fee of all the relocated vendors for the period May 2014 up to the project completion date tentatively set for September 2014
3. That a draft compensation proposal containing the elements agreed to by both the DTC and PIU will be developed by the PIU and shared in a formal consultation with both the DTC and the relocated vendors (PAPs).
4. In addition, based on World Bank's advice, the proposal is to be translated into both the English and Spanish languages and the services of an Interpreter will be acquired in an effort to accommodate those vendors whose first language is Spanish and have limited knowledge of the English language. Finally, the entire consultation will be documented by the PIU inclusive of pictures taken of the proceedings and the participants which are to be shared with the Bank.

Fourteenth Consultation: 25th, June 2014

Objective:

To share the contents of the latest proposal (a compensation package) with the relocated vendors, and to solicit their signatures for inclusion to an Agreement document signifying their acceptance of the proposal.

Present:

Ag. Mayor Teul

Finance Director (DTC)

Market Supervisor

Project Coordinator (PIU)

Social Officer (PIU)

Public Relations Officer (BSIF)

Relocated Vendors (11) (see attached Agreement)

Decisions/Action Taken:

The proposal was presented in both the English and Spanish languages to the relocated vendors and they all inserted their signatures to the Agreement document thereby signifying their acceptance of the compensation package presented by the DTC to offset economic losses during the implementation phase of the Dangriga Market subproject. Shortly thereafter, a scanned copy of the signed Agreement, accompanied by a report and some photos of the proceedings were compiled by the PIU and submitted to World Bank.